|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Atmosphere, decor, clothing | | | Expressions and ethnicity | | |
| **Description** | **Analysis (what might it mean?)** | **Evaluation (what do you know?)** | **Description** | **Analysis (what might it mean?)** | **Evaluation (what do you know?)** |
| **Representations of Polish grandmothers** | Atmosphere is dark and gloomy. The lighting isn't bright. | Could indicate a lack of modern lighting and/or electricity.  Might represent the grandmothers making an early morning breakfast.  Stereotyped, ageist view, by generalizing that all might rise at a very early hour to make pancakes? | This does not reflect the living conditions and/or technology available in modern day Poland. Similarly, how someone lives depends upon their means, wealth and family ties.  There is a strong sense of family tradition and values, highlighting the significance of intergenerational relationships and contributions. Nevertheless, it is important to acknowledge that individuals, including grandmothers, have diverse lifestyles and preferences. | Most appear to be looking down or away. | Might represent a melancholic and depressing environment. | There are socio-historic rationales for portraying the women in such a way (e.g., World War I and World War II, followed by the Cold War). However, this is problematic as they represent stereotyped, gendered and xenophobic representations of elderly Polish women. |
| Each avatar is wearing clothing with floral patterns and a headscarf. | This clothing is stereotypical of elderly Polish women.  The women could be wearing headscarves for religious reasons or to keep their hair back when cooking. | Wearing a head scarf or covering is common practice in many religions. In some denominations of Christianity, they are only worn in churches to signify humility and modesty. Approximately 90% of the Polish population identify themselves as Catholic.  Whilst some Polish women may wear headscarves when attending church, the practice of wearing them in the home or daily life can be influenced by personal choices, family traditions, or regional customs. | All the women are White or appear to be White. | Could be due to how algorithms encode the concept of a Polish person. | Around 97% of the population in Poland identifies as ethnically Polish, so perhaps the representations are close to portraying the norm. |
| **Representations of Russian grandmothers** | Atmosphere is dark and gloomy. The lighting isn't bright. | Could indicate a lack of modern lighting and/or electricity.  Might represent the grandmothers making an early morning breakfast.  Stereotyped, ageist view, by generalizing that all might rise at a very early hour to make pancakes? | This does not reflect the living conditions and/or technology available in modern day Russia. Similarly, how someone lives depends upon their means, wealth and family ties.  There is a strong sense of family tradition and values, highlighting the significance of intergenerational relationships and contributions. Nevertheless, it is important to acknowledge that individuals, including grandmothers, have diverse lifestyles and preferences. | Most appear to be looking down or away. | Might represent a melancholic and depressing environment. | There are socio-historic rationales for portraying the women in such a way (e.g., World War I and World War II, followed by the Cold War). However, this is problematic as they represent stereotyped, gendered and xenophobic representations of elderly Russian women. |
|  | Each avatar is wearing clothing with floral patterns and a headscarf. | This clothing is stereotypical of elderly Russian women.  The women could be wearing headscarves for religious reasons or to keep their hair back when cooking. | Wearing a head scarf or covering is common practice in many religions. In some denominations of Christianity, they are only worn in churches to signify humility and modesty. Approximately 85% of the Russian population identify as Russian Orthodox Christians.  Whilst some Russian women may wear headscarves when attending church, the practice of wearing them in the home or daily life can be influenced by personal choices, family traditions, or regional customs. | All the women are White or appear to be White. | Could be due to how algorithms encode the concept of a Russian person.  For example, does 'Russian' mean a citizen of Russia, and therefore anyone who lives in Russia? If this is the case, then it is likely dominant views that inform datasets will skew any possible representations. Alternatively, does it mean those that see themselves as ethnically Russian? If this is the case, then perhaps it is valid to show only Slavic/European avatars. In either case, the representations are problematic as they highlight whatever the dominant 'norm' is whilst erasing Russia's rich diversity. | Russia has 193 ethnic groups, yet the images portray a high level of homogeneity. The images portray avatars that only represent those who appear Slavic and/or European (i.e. White). There are no representations of other types of Russians who may be Turkic, Indigenous, or Mongolian in origin. |
| **Representations of grandmothers from the US** | Homes appear to be modern in some respects. There is less clutter and more light. | This might indicate modern homes that are efficient. | This does not reflect the living conditions of all ‘Americans’. | Warm and positive expressions. The first one appears thoughtful and focused on what she is doing with almost a sense of enjoyment. The second one appears content. The third and fourth images appear to represent a wholly positive image of two different women engaging in cooking. | Implies a sense of satisfaction and ease. This could stem from the cooking activity itself or from the overall environment and circumstances, contributing to a positive and harmonious mood.  It suggests a celebration of women's roles in culinary activities and fosters a positive perception of such engagement. This may reinforce the idea that culinary activities are associated with warmth and positivity. | Media and visual representations can shape societal attitudes and stereotypes. |
|  | Hair styled and wearing modern clothes. | The hair and clothing might represent the socio-economic background of these women. | An individual's appearance may not always accurately reflect their socio-economic status.  Other influences include personal choice and fashion trends. These factors may not necessarily be linked to their socio-economic background. | Each avatar represents a White woman. | If white women are seen as the default or predominant image for this demographic group, it may lead to stereotyping, overlooking the rich diversity of American society. | The US has a population of over 330 million with nearly 80 million (nearly 1 in 4) who consist of non-White people. So why has the generative AI tool created only White faces to represent ‘American’?  Such representation choices can have cultural and societal implications, as they may reinforce or perpetuate certain racial or ethnic biases and norms. It raises questions about the visibility and recognition of women from other racial and ethnic backgrounds, potentially marginalizing their experiences and stories. |
| **Representations of grandmothers from the US racialized as Black** | Bottom two avatars look like a home kitchen (as indicated by kitchen cabinets/cupboards). Top-left appears to be a larger, commercial kitchen and top-right a TV studio (as indicated by the lighting and focus).  Two of the avatars are wearing cleaning gloves and three are wearing a chef’s hat.  The tiles and general workspaces appear utilitarian in nature compared with those portrayed as racialized as White. | Doe this relate to the roles of these avatars? They could be cooks or chefs.  Three of the avatars are situated in positions of service. This could suggest they’re in a lower socio-economic position. | In contrast, the White representations of American grandmothers don’t appear to be in positions of service. However, whilst it's true that certain service-oriented jobs may be associated with lower pay, occupation alone does not always determine one's socio-economic position.  Socio-economic status is influenced by various factors such as education, income, wealth, and social support systems.  Assuming that individuals in service roles are in a lower socio-economic position can perpetuate stereotypes and overlook the diversity within these professions. People may choose these jobs for various reasons, including personal interests, career aspirations, or while pursuing education in other fields. | They all appear to be smiling and enjoying what they’re doing. Some have red makeup on their nose/ lips. | There are historic reasons as to why Black American women have been portrayed in a certain way. These are often rooted in racist, gendered and classist stereotypes. | One stereotypical representation is a ‘mammy,’ or a good-natured, submissive and motherly figure who would provide care for White families. For example, “Aunt Jemima” is a well-known fictional advertising icon for ready-mixed pancake flour in the US. It reinforces the national stereotype of the slave plantation ‘mammy’ (King, 2019,). This perhaps symbolises the dominance of hegemonic white memory and imagination in American society (Wallace-Sanders, 2008).  The origins of stereotyped representations can also lie, in part, in 1800s minstrelsy (Bowdre, 2006; Downing, 2007; Thompson Moore, 2021). In minstrel shows, White men portrayed Black Americans by blackening their faces using burnt cork whilst exaggerating other facial features with red or white paint. Minstrelsy has aided stereotypes around people racialized as Black and continues to inform media representations of Black American men and women in the present day (Bowdre, 2006). |